

# **Analytic narratives and other systematic and rigorous ways to do case study and qualitative comparative research**

Professor Margaret Levi

Jere L. Bacharach Professor of International Studies and Political Science

University of Washington, Seattle

## REQUIREMENTS:

1. Choose one class session at which to present an assessment of the readings. Come prepared to present what you see as the central questions we should address in seminar.
2. Choose one of the books in week VI, write a 2-3 page summary, and be prepared to present the summary in class. Be particularly attentive to the book's methodological weaknesses and strengths.
3. A seminar paper. I shall discuss possible papers individually with each student.

## BACKGROUND READING:

Theda Skocpol, *States and Social Revolutions*. This book is referred to by many of the authors on the syllabus. Please read it or reread it in preparation for the seminar.

### ***I. I.            Introduction***

Weber, Max. 1949 (1905). "Objective Possibility and Adequate Causation in Historical Explanation." In *The Methodology of the Social Sciences*, edited by Weber.

We shall discuss the qualitative methodological problems the students in the seminar are confronting in their own research.

### ***II. II.            Creating the comparative method in political science***

Sartori, Giovanni. 1970. "Concept Misformation in Comparative Politics." *American Political Science Review* 64 :4 (December):1033-1053.

Liphart, Arend. 1971. "Comparative Politics and Comparative Method." *American Political Science Review* 65 (682-695).

Eckstein, Harry. 1975. "Case Study and Theory in Political Science." In *Handbook of Sociology*, edited by N. Smelser..

Liphart, Arend. 1975. "The Comparable Cases Strategy in Comparative Research." *Comparative Political Studies* 8:158-77.

George, Alexander. 1989. "Case Studies and Theory Development: The Method of Structured, Focused Comparison". In Diplomacy: New Approaches in History, Theory, and Policy, edited by P. G. Lawrence. New York: Free Press, 43-68.

Lieberson, Stanley. 1991. "Small N's and Big Conclusions: An Examination of the Reasoning in Comparative Studies Based on a Small Number of Cases." *Social Forces* 70: 2 (December):307-320.

Collier, David, and James Mahoney. 1993. "Conceptual Stretching Revisited: Adapting Categories in Comparative Analysis." *American Political Science Review* 87:845-55.

### **III. III. The New Orthodoxy**

King, Gary, Robert Keohane, and Sidney Verba. 1994. *Scientific Inference in Qualitative Research*. Princeton, New Jersey: Princeton University Press.

#### **Suggested readings:**

Geddes, Barbara. 1990. "How the Cases You Choose Affect the Answers You Get: Selection Bias in Comparative Politics". In *Political Analysis*, edited by J. Stimson. Ann Arbor: University of Michigan, 131-150.

Collier, D., and J. Mahoney. 1996. "Insights and pitfalls - Selection bias in qualitative research." *World Politics* 49 (1):56-&.

Ragin, Charles. 1997. "Turning the Tables: How Case-Oriented Research Challenges Variable-Oriented Research." *Comparative Social Research* 16:27-42.

Dion, Douglas. 1998. "Evidence and Inference in the Comparative Case Study." *Comparative Politics* 30:127-45.

### **IV. IV. The debate in historical sociology**

Kiser, Edgar, and Michael Hechter. 1991. "The Role of General Theory in Comparative-Historical Sociology." *American Journal of Sociology* 97:1-30.

Kiser, Edgar. 1994. "Markets and Hierarchies in Early Modern Tax Systems: A Principal-Agent Analysis." *Politics & Society* 22 (3):285-316.

Somers, Margaret R. 1998. "We're No Angels." *American Journal of Sociology* 104 (3): 722-784

Kiser, Edgar, and Michael Hechter. 1998. "The Debate on Historical Sociology." *American Journal of Sociology* 104 (3):785-816.

Boudon, Raymond. 1998. "Limitations of Rational Choice Theory." *American Journal of Sociology* 104 (3):817-828.

Goldstone, Jack A. 1998. "Initial Conditions, General Laws, Path Dependence, and Explanation in Historical Sociology." *American Journal of Sociology* 104 (3):829-845.

Calhoun, Craig. 1998. "Explanation in Historical Sociology: Narrative, General Theory and Historically Specific Theory." *American Journal of Sociology* 104 (3):846-871.

## **V. V. Analytic narratives**

Robert Bates, Avner Greif, Margaret Levi, Jean-Laurent Rosenthal, and Barry Weingast. *Analytic Narratives*.

Elster, Jon. 2000. "Rational Choice History: A Case of Excessive Ambition." *American Political Science Review* 94 (3):685-695.

Bates, R. H., A. Greif, M. Levi, J. L. Rosenthal, and B. R. Weingast. 2000. "The analytic narrative project." *American Political Science Review* 94 (3):696-702.

Carpenter, Daniel P. 2000. "What is the Marginal Value of Analytic Narratives?" *Social Science History* 24 (4):653-668.

Skocpol, Theda. 2000. "Commentary: Theory Tackles History." *Social Science History* 24 (4):669-676.

Parikh, Sunita. 2000. "The Strategic Value of Analytic Narratives." *Social Science History* 24 (4):677-684.

Bates, Robert H., Avner Greif, Margaret Levi, Jean-Laurent Rosenthal, and Barry Weingast. 2000. "Analytic Narratives Revisited." *Social Science History* 24 (4):685-696.

## **VI. VI. Applications**

Read and come prepared to discuss one of the following, or another book that I have approved:

Gill, Anthony. 1998. *Rendering Unto Caesar: The Political Economy of Church-State Relations in Latin America*.

Golden, Miriam. 1997. *Heroic Defeats: The Politics of Job Loss*.

Laitin, David D. 1998. *Identity in Formation : The Russian-speaking Populations in the Near Abroad*.

Levi, Margaret. 1997. *Consent, Dissent and Patriotism*.

Murillo, Maria Victoria. 2001. *Partisan Coalitions and Labor Competition in Latin America: Trade Unions and Market Reforms..*

Petersen, Roger. 2001. *Resistance and Rebellion: Lessons from Eastern Europe*.

## **VII. VII. Counterfactuals**

Fearon, James D. 1991. "Counterfactuals and Hypothesis Testing in Political Science." *World Politics* 43 (2):169-195.

Weingast, Barry R. 1996. "Off-the-Path Behavior: A Game-Theoretic Approach to Counterfactuals and Its Implications for Political and Historical Analysis." In *Counterfactual Thought Experiments in World Politics*, edited by Tetlock, P. E. and A. Belkin. Princeton: Princeton University Press.

Bueno de Mesquita, Bruce. 1996. "Counterfactuals and International Affairs: Some Insights from Game Theory." In *Counterfactual Thought Experiments in World Politics*, edited by Tetlock, P. E. and A. Belkin. Princeton, New Jersey: Princeton University Press.

Tetlock, Philip E., and Aron Belkin. 1996. *Counterfactual Thought Experiments in World Politics*. Their introduction.

Tetlock, Philip E. 1998. "Close-Call Counterfactual and Belief-System Defenses: I was Not Almost Wrong But I Was Almost Right." *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology* 75 (3):639-652.

## **VIII. VIII. Games and processes**

Scharpf, Fritz. 1994. "Games Real Actors Could Play: Positive and Negative Coordination in Embedded Negotiations." *Journal of Theoretical Politics* 6 (1):27-53.

Geddes, Barbara. 1999. "Comparisons in the Context of a Game Theoretic Argument." In *Critical Comparisons in Politics and Culture*, edited by Bowen, J. and R. Petersen. New York: Cambridge University Press.

Golden, Miriam. 1999. "Case Studies of Contemporary Job Loss." In *Critical Comparisons in Politics and Culture*, edited by Bowen, J. and R. Petersen. New York: Cambridge University Press.

Levi, Margaret. 1999. "Producing an Analytic Narrative." In *Critical Comparisons in Politics and Culture*, edited by Bowen, J. and R. Petersen. New York: Cambridge University Press.

<http://www.georgetown.edu/bennett/>: [Process Tracing in Case Study Methods](#)

## **IX. IX. Combining the Qualitative and Quantitative**

Charles Ragin. *Fuzzy Set Social Science* (selections)

John Goldthorpe. 2000. *On Sociology: Numbers, Narratives, and the Integration of Research and Theory* (selections)

## **X. X. Culture, Interpretation, and Narrative**

Taylor, Michael. 1989. "Structure, Culture, and Action." *Politics & Society* 17:115-162.

Ferejohn, John. 1991. "Rationality and Interpretation: Parliamentary Elections in Early Stuart England." In *The Economic Approach to Politics*, edited by Monroe, K. R. New York: Harper Collins.

Kiser, Edgar. 1996. "The Revival of Narrative in Historical Sociology: What Rational Choice Theory Can Contribute." *Politics & Society* 24 (3):249-271.

Sewell, William H., Jr. 1996. "Three Temporalities: Toward an Eventful Sociology." In *The Historic Turn in the Human Sciences*, edited by McDonald, T. J. Ann Arbor: University of Michigan.

Mahoney, J. 1999. "Nominal, ordinal, and narrative appraisal in macrocausal analysis." *American Journal of Sociology* 104 (4):1154-1196.

Barth, Fredrik. 1999. "Comparative Methodologies in the Analysis of Anthropological Data." In *Critical Comparisons in Politics and Culture*, edited by Bowen, J. and R. Petersen. New York: Cambridge University Press.

## **XI. XI. Sequences, Tips, and Path Dependence**

Rueschemeyer, Dietrich, and John D. Stephens. 1997. "Comparing Historical Sequences: A Powerful Tool for Causal Analysis." *Comparative Social Research* 16:55-72.

Kuran, Timor. 1989. "Sparks and Prairie Fires: A Theory of Unanticipated Political Revolution." *Public Choice* 61:41-74.

Laitin, David. 1999. "National Revivals and Violence." In *Critical Comparisons in Politics and Culture*, edited by Bowen, J. and R. Petersen. New York: Cambridge University Press.

Arthur, Brian. 1989. "Competing Technologies, Increasing Returns, and Lock-in By Historical Events." *The Economic Journal* 99:116-131.

David, Paul. 1985. "Clio and the Economics of QWERTY." *American Economic Review* 75 (2):332-337.

Thelen, Kathleen. 1999. "Historical Institutionalism in Comparative Politics." *Annual Review of Political Science* 2:369-404.

Pierson, Paul. 2000. "Increasing Returns, Path Dependency, and the Study of Politics." *American Political Science Review* 94 (2):251-267.

Mahoney, J. 2000. "Path dependence in historical sociology." *Theory and Society* 29 (4):507-548.

## **XII. XII. Causal Mechanisms**

Schelling, Thomas C. 1998. "Social Mechanisms and Social Dynamics." In *Social Mechanisms*, edited by Hedstrom, P. and R. Swedberg. New York: Cambridge University Press.

Elster, Jon. 1998. "A Plea for Mechanisms." In *Social Mechanisms*, edited by Hedstrom, P. and R. Swedberg. New York: Cambridge University Press.

Petersen, Roger. 1999. "Mechanisms and Structures in Comparison." In *Critical Comparisons in Politics and Culture*, edited by Bowen, J. and R. Petersen. New York: Cambridge University Press.

Tilly, Charles. 2001. "Mechanisms in Political Processes." *Annual Review of Political Science* 4:21-41.

<http://www.georgetown.edu/bennett/>: [Causal Inference in Case Studies: From Mill's Methods to Causal Mechanisms](#)